

P/2011/0437/PA
Roundham With Hyde Ward
3 Sunhill Apartments, 19 Alta Vista Road, Paignton
Change of use from holiday use to residential use

Site Details

Block of holiday flats on the southern side of Alta Vista Road with good views at the rear across Youngs Park and Goodrington Sands. The property was formerly an hotel (The Sunhill Hotel) and was granted planning approval for conversion into holiday flats in two phases in 2003 and 2004.

Relevant Planning History

- P/2003/0571 Alterations and Conversion of Part Of Hotel to Form 6 Holiday Units (Phase 1)
Approved 16th July 2003
- P/2004/0038 Alterations an Conversion of Part of Hotel to Form 6 Holiday Units (Phase 2) Approved
25th February 2004
- P/2010/1245 Change of use from holiday to residential at unit 5 Vista Apartments. (Next Door to this
Application) Approved 13 April 2011.
- P/2010/1364 Change of use from holiday to residential at unit 15 Vista Apartments. (Next Door to this
Application) Approved 13 April 2011.
- ZP/2010/0322 Pre Application Enquiry 11 Sunhill Apartments Holiday Use to Permanent Residential.
Likely to receive favourable consideration

Other similar applications seeking residential use of holiday properties at the following addresses are also on this agenda:-

- 1 at Belvedere, Marine Drive,
- Nos 2 and 11 at Sunhill Apartments, Alta Vista Road
- 1 at Carlton Manor, Roundham Road,
- 1 application (10 units) at Goodrington Lodge, Alta Vista Road.
- 1 application (11 units) at 5 Colin Road

Relevant Policies

Saved Adopted Torbay Local Plan
relevant policies

- TU6 PHAA
- CF6 Community Infrastructure Contributions
- CF7 Education contributions

Also relevant are:-

Revised guidance on PHAA's adopted by the Council in March 2010 (Report no. 73/2010), and LDD6 (Planning contributions and affordable housing) adopted April 2008, and the subsequent update (mitigation and clarification) paper of June 2010.

Proposals

Permission is sought for a change of use at flat 3 to allow residential occupation in what is currently a holiday flat controlled by condition on the original approval. The condition states that the 'the occupation of the holiday units hereby approved shall be restricted to bona fide holiday makers for individual periods not exceeding 4 weeks in total in any consecutive period of 13 weeks. A register of holiday makers shall be kept and made available to inspection by an authorised Officer of the Council at all reasonable times. Reason: The site is situated within a Principal Holiday Accommodation Area and in order to preserve the character of the area it is important that the units are retained strictly for holiday letting purposes.' Allowing the change of use would allow residential occupation but by virtue of the Use Classes Order would also permit holiday use.

Consultations

Observations Awaited from Carolyn Custerson Chief Executive Residents and Visitors Services

Representations

One letter received and re-produced at Page P.201.

Key Issues/Material Considerations

The property is a medium sized block of holiday flats situated within a Principle Holiday Accommodation Area, as defined by policy TU6.12 of the Saved Adopted Torbay Local Plan. The purpose of this policy is to resist changes of use away from holiday accommodation where that change would be detrimental to the character and function of the Principal Holiday Accommodation Area. This usually results in refusal to grant planning permissions to change of uses from holiday accommodation to permanent residential occupation.

Recent changes in holiday trends has led the Council to re-examine and re-interpret the policy in order to ensure that it is up to date, clear and gives a degree of flexibility in the current economic climate. The Council's adopted Tourism Strategy (2009) recommends a reduction in small and marginally located accommodation and the promotion of the best areas as Core Tourism Development Areas. Last year, the Council adopted a revised interpretation of the PHAA policy. Although the Revised Guidance does not form part of the LDF or Local Plan, it is capable of constituting a material consideration although would not carry as much weight as the Saved Adopted Torbay Local Plan.

Following consideration of 7 holiday apartments within the Belvedere complex off Marine Drive at April's meeting of the Development Management Committee, it is now clear that applications involving the loss of holiday accommodation first need to be tested against policy TU6. This policy states clearly that applications involving the loss of holiday accommodation within an identified P.H.A.A. should be tested against 4 key criteria and that they may be permitted where the following criteria apply:-

- a) the premises lack an appropriate basic range of facilities and do not offer scope or potential for improvement, thereby failing to meet the reasonable requirements of the tourist;
- b) the premises have restricted bedspace capacity, having a limited number of bedrooms (if serviced) or apartments (if self-catering);
- c) the loss of the premises would not be to the detriment of the holiday character of the particular locality, nor set an unacceptable precedent in relation to the concentration and role of nearby premises; and
- d) the proposed new use or development is compatible with the surrounding tourism related uses and does not harm the holiday character and atmosphere of the PHAA.

The Sunhill Apartments holiday properties were specifically formed by conversion of the Sunhill Hotel and therefore have been converted recently and to a high standard. The prevailing context of Alta Vista Road is of a strong holiday character and with many properties along the road being in holiday use. For these reasons it is not considered that the Sunhill Apartments would meet all of the above referenced tests.

If Members were minded to approve this application consideration should be given to the need for a planning obligation under s106 of the Town and Country Planning Act to offset the costs that would arise from this proposal. It had previously been Council policy not to charge for such contributions where the amount would have been less than £5000. However, this has now been amended by Full Council at its meeting on 24th March 2011, such that smaller developments must now also contribute to any adverse impacts they may generate, with no minimum threshold for contributions. This application was received after this date therefore a developer contribution is applicable as follows :

Category 2 (55-74 sq m)	
Municipal waste and recycling	£ 50
Sustainable transportation	£860 (50% residential rate)
Education (primary only)	£410
Lifelong learning	£220

Green space and recreation £1120

TOTAL PAYMENT £2660

In terms of on site car parking provision the original planning approvals for the conversions to holiday flats indicated 24 spaces to the front and rear of the property (controlled by condition). This level of provision is considered to be appropriate for permanent residential occupancy.

Sustainability - The proposal is a sustainable one in as much as it creates residential accommodation on an existing brownfield site.

Crime and Disorder - Not an issue in this instance as the units are already in existence and the requirement for crime prevention will not alter.

Disability Issues - This will remain the same as existing, and so there are no new issues arising from these current proposals.

Conclusions

When this proposal is tested against the relevant policies of the Saved Adopted Local Plan it fails. This is consistent with other decisions relating to holiday properties within P.H.A.A.'s, although some have been allowed under a different interpretation of the policy, including two in complex next door. On balance, it is considered that the L.P.A. should not continue with decisions that are now thought to be a wrong interpretation of the policy even though that might lead to inconsistencies in the decision making process. It is now clear that proposals which fail to meet the tests of TU6 should be refused on policy grounds. The Sunhill Holiday Apartments were specifically formed by conversion of the Sunhill Hotel and therefore have been converted recently and to a high standard. The prevailing context of Alta Vista Road is of a strong holiday character and with many properties along the road being in holiday use. For these reasons it is not considered that the Sunhill Apartments would meet all of the above referenced tests.

Recommendation

The application should be refused on the basis of failing to meet all of the tests imposed by policy TU6.

Condition(s):

01. The applicant has failed to provide or legally agree to, any contributions in order to offset the costs involved in supporting essential community facilities such as transport services, education facilities, the provision of open space and to maintain infrastructure stemming directly from development that would arise to the Local Authority and the tax payer as a result of this proposal. This makes the proposal contrary to policies CF6 and CF7 of the Saved Adopted Torbay Local Plan (1995 – 2011) and to the subsequent adopted policy position of the Adopted Supplementary Planning Document LDD6 (“Planning Contributions and Affordable housing: Priorities and Delivery”, adopted in May 2008) and the more recent update the ‘Planning contributions and affordable housing supplementary document, update 2: Economic Recovery Measures’, (adopted by the Council in June 2010.)

02. The proposal to change the use of flat 3 Sunhill Apartments from a holiday home to a residential dwelling is contrary to policy TU6 of the Saved Adopted Torbay Local Plan which seeks to prevent such changes of use within identified Principal Holiday Accommodation Areas (PHAAs) where that change would be to the detriment of the character and function of the PHAA. The Sunhill Apartments at 19 Alta Vista Road, is a purposely converted block of holiday flats within the Roundham Road West Paignton PHAA as defined by policy TU6.12. The paper adopted by the Council in March 2010 provides guidance which interprets and clarifies the policy in the light of recent trends and changes to the holiday industry, however, it does not supersede or nullify the primacy of policy TU6. The Council having regard to the revised guidance on PHAA's, consider that the proposal would fail to

meet tests (a) to (d) set out in policy TU6, and there are no other change in circumstance that would justify a breach of the adopted policy.